

CITY AND COUNTY OF SWANSEA

NOTICE OF MEETING

You are invited to attend a Meeting of the

SCRUTINY PROGRAMME COMMITTEE

At: Committee Room 3A, Guildhall, Swansea

On: Wednesday, 18 November 2015

Time: 5.00 pm

AGENDA


Summary: This is the agenda pack for a special meeting of the Scrutiny Programme Committee taking place on the 18 November 2015. The main item is pre-decision scrutiny of Cabinet report on Disposal of Former Civic Centre and Adjoining Land, Penllergaer.

	Page No.
1 Apologies for Absence.	
2 Disclosures of Personal & Prejudicial Interest.	1 - 2
3 Prohibition of Whipped Votes and Declaration of Party Whips.	
4 Pre-Decision Scrutiny - Role of the Committee.	3 - 5
5 Exclusion of the Public.	6 - 9
6 Pre-Decision Scrutiny : Disposal of Former Civic Centre and Adjoining Land, Penllergaer - Report of the Cabinet Member for Finance & Strategy.	
a Presentation of Cabinet Report and Questions.	10 - 24
b Committee's Views for Cabinet.	

Members of the public are welcome to attend the above Panel / Working Group meetings. Contact the Scrutiny Team if you would like to attend.

Connect with Scrutiny:

Gloucester Room, Guildhall, Swansea. SA1 4PW (Tel. 01792 637732)
Web: www.swansea.gov.uk/scrutiny **Twitter:** @swanseascrutiny
Email: scrutiny@swansea.gov.uk **Blog:** www.swanseascrutiny.co.uk
Like us on Facebook: www.facebook.com/swanseascrutiny



Patrick Arran
Head of Legal and Democratic Services
12 November 2015

Contact: Democratic Services: - 6369263

SCRUTINY PROGRAMME COMMITTEE (16)

Labour Councillors: 11

Uta Clay	T J Hennegan
A M Cook	D J Lewis
D W Cole	G Owens
S E Crouch	R V Smith (Vice Chair)
J P Curtice	G J Tanner
N J Davies	

Liberal Democrat Councillors: 3

M H Jones (Chair)	P M Meara
J W Jones	

Independent Councillor: 1

E W Fitzgerald	
----------------	--

Conservative Councillor: 1

A C S Colburn	
---------------	--

Co-opted Members:

Name	Term of Office
David Anderson-Thomas	14.03.2014 – 13.03.2017
Sarah Joiner	08.07.2013 – 07.07.2017

Officers:

Dean Taylor	Director of Corporate Services
Lee Wenham	Head of Marketing, Communications & Scrutiny
Dave Mckenna	Overview & Scrutiny Manager
Brij Madahar	Overview & Scrutiny Coordinator
Democratic Services	
Wendy Parkin	Legal
Archives	

Email:

Executive Board	
Cabinet Members	
Leaders of Opposition Groups	
Carl Billingsley	
Chair of Standards Committee	
Chair of Audit Committee	
Chair of Democratic Services Committee	

Total Copies: 30

Disclosures of Interest

To receive Disclosures of Interest from Councillors and Officers

Councillors

Councillors Interests are made in accordance with the provisions of the Code of Conduct adopted by the City and County of Swansea. You must disclose orally to the meeting the existence and nature of that interest.

NOTE: You are requested to identify the Agenda Item / Minute No. / Planning Application No. and Subject Matter to which that interest relates and to enter all declared interests on the sheet provided for that purpose at the meeting.

1. If you have a **Personal Interest** as set out in **Paragraph 10** of the Code, you **MAY STAY, SPEAK AND VOTE** unless it is also a Prejudicial Interest.
2. If you have a Personal Interest which is also a **Prejudicial Interest** as set out in **Paragraph 12** of the Code, then subject to point 3 below, you **MUST WITHDRAW** from the meeting (unless you have obtained a dispensation from the Authority's Standards Committee)
3. Where you have a Prejudicial Interest you may attend the meeting but only for the purpose of making representations, answering questions or giving evidence relating to the business, **provided** that the public are also allowed to attend the meeting for the same purpose, whether under a statutory right or otherwise. In such a case, you **must withdraw from the meeting immediately after the period for making representations, answering questions, or giving evidence relating to the business has ended**, and in any event before further consideration of the business begins, whether or not the public are allowed to remain in attendance for such consideration (**Paragraph 14** of the Code).
4. Where you have agreement from the Monitoring Officer that the information relating to your Personal Interest is **sensitive information**, as set out in **Paragraph 16** of the Code of Conduct, your obligation to disclose such information is replaced with an obligation to disclose the existence of a personal interest and to confirm that the Monitoring Officer has agreed that the nature of such personal interest is sensitive information.
5. If you are relying on a **grant of a dispensation** by the Standards Committee, you must, before the matter is under consideration:
 - i) Disclose orally both the interest concerned and the existence of the dispensation; and
 - ii) Before or immediately after the close of the meeting give written notification to the Authority containing:

- a) Details of the prejudicial interest;
- b) Details of the business to which the prejudicial interest relates;
- c) Details of, and the date on which, the dispensation was granted; and
- d) Your signature

Officers

Financial Interests

1. If an Officer has a financial interest in any matter which arises for decision at any meeting to which the Officer is reporting or at which the Officer is in attendance involving any member of the Council and /or any third party the Officer shall declare an interest in that matter and take no part in the consideration or determination of the matter and shall withdraw from the meeting while that matter is considered. Any such declaration made in a meeting of a constitutional body shall be recorded in the minutes of that meeting. No Officer shall make a report to a meeting for a decision to be made on any matter in which s/he has a financial interest.
2. A “financial interest” is defined as any interest affecting the financial position of the Officer, either to his/her benefit or to his/her detriment. It also includes an interest on the same basis for any member of the Officers family or a close friend and any company firm or business from which an Officer or a member of his/her family receives any remuneration. There is no financial interest for an Officer where a decision on a report affects all of the Officers of the Council or all of the officers in a Department or Service.

Report of the Chair

Scrutiny Programme Committee – 18 November 2015

PRE-DECISION SCRUTINY OF CABINET REPORT – DISPOSAL OF FORMER CIVIC CENTRE AND ADJOINING LAND, PENLLERGAER (ROLE OF THE COMMITTEE)

Purpose	This report advises the committee of the aim of the meeting and provides guidance on pre-decision scrutiny ahead of consideration of the Cabinet report on 'Disposal of Former Civic Centre and Adjoining Land, Penllergaer'
Content	This report is focussed on the role of the committee in undertaking pre-decision scrutiny.
Councillors are being asked to	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• consider the Cabinet report and proposals• agree any views on the proposed decision that are to be submitted to Cabinet
Lead Councillor	Councillor Mary Jones, Chair of Scrutiny Programme Committee
Lead Cabinet Member / Officer(s)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Councillor Rob Stewart – Cabinet Member for Finance & Strategy• Phil Roberts, Director – Place
Report Author	Brij Madahar, Scrutiny Coordinator Telephone: 01792 637257 brij.madahar@swansea.gov.uk

1. Introduction

- 1.1 A councillor request for pre-decision scrutiny of the Cabinet report on the 'Disposal of Former Civic Centre and Adjoining Land, Penllergaer' was received. The report is due to be considered by Cabinet on 19 November. As a result a special Scrutiny Programme Committee has been arranged in order to undertake pre-decision scrutiny of this report.

2. Cabinet Report

- 2.1 The committee will note that this Cabinet report is an exempt report which necessitates discussion by the committee in closed session. The report is included in the agenda papers as Item 6.

3. Role of the Committee

3.1 Pre-decision scrutiny provides the opportunity for consultation with non-Executive Members on fully developed proposals, where a clear recommendation exists, before decisions are taken by the Executive.

3.2 This meeting will enable the committee to gain information and develop an understanding of this matter, and, acting as a 'critical friend', to ask questions and comment on the report. This gives scrutiny a valuable opportunity to inform and influence decision-making through debate and challenge.

3.3 Councillor Rob Stewart, Cabinet Member for Finance & Strategy, is unable to attend the meeting due to pre-existing diary commitments. However relevant officer(s) involved in the development of the report will be in attendance to assist the committee and provide appropriate advice.

3.4 In terms of key questions, the Committee may want to consider:

- the rationale for the report
- robustness of the proposed decision and process
- potential impact and implications (including policy / performance / budget issues) and risks
- how different options have been considered
- the extent of consultation undertaken

3.5 In sharing its views with cabinet this may include giving support, providing other suggestions on the way forward, or flagging up any concerns.

3.6 The committee (through the chair) will have the opportunity to present its views, conclusions and recommendations about the report to Cabinet on 19 November. These views are required to be formally considered by Cabinet before it makes the decision and feedback should be given to the committee including explanation for any rejection of views expressed.

4. Legal Implications

4.1 In accordance with the Council's Constitution "pre-decision scrutiny gives scrutiny the opportunity to influence Cabinet decision making as a critical friend". "The views of the scrutiny committee are formally presented (either in a written report or verbally by the scrutiny Chair) to the Cabinet meeting for the Cabinet to consider and inform its decision making".

5. Financial Implications

- 5.1 There are no specific financial implications raised by this report. Financial implications of the actual cabinet report are contained within that report which is appended.

Background Papers: None

Legal Officer: Debbie Smith

Finance Officer: Carl Billingsley

Agenda Item 5

Report of the Head of Legal, Democratic Services & Procurement

Special Scrutiny Programme Committee – 18 November 2015

EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

Purpose:	To consider whether the Public should be excluded from the following item of business.	
Policy Framework:	None.	
Reason for Decision:	To comply with legislation.	
Consultation:	Legal.	
Recommendation(s):	It is recommended that:	
1)	The public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of the following item of business on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as set out in the Paragraphs listed below of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 subject to the Public Interest Test (where appropriate) being applied.	
	Item No.	Relevant Paragraphs in Schedule 12A
	5	14
Report Author:	Democratic Services	
Finance Officer:	Not Applicable	
Legal Officer:	Patrick Arran – Head of Legal, Democratic Services and Procurement (Monitoring Officer)	

1. Introduction

- 1.1 Section 100A (4) of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007, allows a Principal Council to pass a resolution excluding the public from a meeting during an item of business.
- 1.2 Such a resolution is dependant on whether it is likely, in view of the nature of the business to be transacted or the nature of the proceedings that if members of the public were present during that item there would be disclosure to them of exempt information, as defined in section 100I of the Local Government Act 1972.

2. Exclusion of the Public / Public Interest Test

- 2.1 In order to comply with the above mentioned legislation, the Committee will be requested to exclude the public from the meeting during consideration of the item of business identified in the recommendation to the report on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as set out in the Exclusion Paragraphs of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as

amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

- 2.2 Information which falls within paragraphs 12 to 15, 17 and 18 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended is exempt information if and so long as in all the circumstances of the case, the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information.
- 2.3 The specific Exclusion Paragraphs and the Public Interest Tests to be applied are listed in **Appendix A**.
- 2.4 Where paragraph 16 of the Schedule 12A applies there is no public interest test. Councillors are able to consider whether they wish to waive their legal privilege in the information, however, given that this may place the Council in a position of risk, it is not something that should be done as a matter of routine.

3. Financial Implications

- 3.1 There are no financial implications associated with this report.

4. Legal Implications

- 4.1 The legislative provisions are set out in the report.
- 4.2 Councillors must consider with regard to each item of business set out in paragraph 2 of this report the following matters:
 - 4.2.1 Whether in relation to that item of business the information is capable of being exempt information, because it falls into one of the paragraphs set out in Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended and reproduced in Appendix A to this report.
 - 4.2.2 If the information does fall within one or more of paragraphs 12 to 15, 17 and 18 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended, the public interest test as set out in paragraph 2.2 of this report.
 - 4.2.3 If the information falls within paragraph 16 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 in considering whether to exclude the public members are not required to apply the public interest test but must consider whether they wish to waive their privilege in relation to that item for any reason.

Background Papers: None.

Appendices: Appendix A – Public Interest Test.

Public Interest Test

No.	Relevant Paragraphs in Schedule 12A
12	Information relating to a particular individual.
	<p>The Proper Officer (Monitoring Officer) has determined in preparing this report that paragraph 12 should apply. His view on the public interest test was that to make this information public would disclose personal data relating to an individual in contravention of the principles of the Data Protection Act. Because of this and since there did not appear to be an overwhelming public interest in requiring the disclosure of personal data he felt that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information. Members are asked to consider this factor when determining the public interest test, which they must decide when considering excluding the public from this part of the meeting.</p>
13	Information which is likely to reveal the identity of an individual.
	<p>The Proper Officer (Monitoring Officer) has determined in preparing this report that paragraph 13 should apply. His view on the public interest test was that the individual involved was entitled to privacy and that there was no overriding public interest which required the disclosure of the individual's identity. On that basis he felt that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information. Members are asked to consider this factor when determining the public interest test, which they must decide when considering excluding the public from this part of the meeting.</p>
14	Information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information).
	<p>The Proper Officer (Monitoring Officer) has determined in preparing this report that paragraph 14 should apply. His view on the public interest test was that:</p> <p>a) Whilst he was mindful of the need to ensure the transparency and accountability of public authority for decisions taken by them in relation to the spending of public money, the right of a third party to the privacy of their financial / business affairs outweighed the need for that information to be made public; or</p> <p>b) Disclosure of the information would give an unfair advantage to tenderers for commercial contracts.</p> <p>This information is not affected by any other statutory provision which requires the information to be publicly registered.</p> <p>On that basis he felt that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information. Members are asked to consider this factor when determining the public interest test, which they must decide when considering excluding the public from this part of the meeting.</p>

No.	Relevant Paragraphs in Schedule 12A
15	<p>Information relating to any consultations or negotiations, or contemplated consultations or negotiations, in connection with any labour relations matter arising between the authority or a Minister of the Crown and employees of, or office holders under, the authority.</p>
	<p>The Proper Officer (Monitoring Officer) has determined in preparing this report that paragraph 15 should apply. His view on the public interest test was that whilst he is mindful of the need to ensure that transparency and accountability of public authority for decisions taken by them he was satisfied that in this case disclosure of the information would prejudice the discussion in relation to labour relations to the disadvantage of the authority and inhabitants of its area. On that basis he felt that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information. Members are asked to consider this factor when determining the public interest test, which they must decide when considering excluding the public from this part of the meeting.</p>
16	<p>Information in respect of which a claim to legal professional privilege could be maintained in legal proceedings.</p>
	<p>No public interest test.</p>
17	<p>Information which reveals that the authority proposes: (a) To give under any enactment a notice under or by virtue of which requirements are imposed on a person; or (b) To make an order or direction under any enactment.</p>
	<p>The Proper Officer (Monitoring Officer) has determined in preparing this report that paragraph 17 should apply. His view on the public interest test was that the authority's statutory powers could be rendered ineffective or less effective were there to be advanced knowledge of its intention/the proper exercise of the Council's statutory power could be prejudiced by the public discussion or speculation on the matter to the detriment of the authority and the inhabitants of its area. On that basis he felt that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information. Members are asked to consider this factor when determining the public interest test, which they must decide when considering excluding the public from this part of the meeting.</p>
18	<p>Information relating to any action taken or to be taken in connection with the prevention, investigation or prosecution of crime</p>
	<p>The Proper Officer (Monitoring Officer) has determined in preparing this report that paragraph 18 should apply. His view on the public interest test was that the authority's statutory powers could be rendered ineffective or less effective were there to be advanced knowledge of its intention/the proper exercise of the Council's statutory power could be prejudiced by public discussion or speculation on the matter to the detriment of the authority and the inhabitants of its area. On that basis he felt that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information. Members are asked to consider this factor when determining the public interest test, which they must decide when considering excluding the public from this part of the meeting.</p>

Agenda Item 6a

By virtue of paragraph(s) 14 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972
as amended by the Local Government (Access to
Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 14 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972
as amended by the Local Government (Access to
Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 14 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972
as amended by the Local Government (Access to
Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted